COMBATING HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN OHIO

Name
Agency
Date
Overview

• Understanding the crime of Human Trafficking
  • Definitions and Stats
  • Why Ohio?

• How trafficking occurs
  • Elements of the crime of trafficking
  • Signs and Indicators

• Key state policy initiatives
  • Laws
  • Governor’s Task Force
  • Rescue and Restore Coalitions
  • Law Enforcement Task Forces

• Resources and Tools
UNDERSTANDING THE CRIME OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING
Understanding Human Trafficking: Definition

*Human trafficking is a form of modern-day slavery where people profit from the control and exploitation of others.*

- Often referred to as *compelled service of others for profit*
- In the United States, must include elements of force, fraud, coercion
- Ohio’s legal definition varies slightly, but idea is the same—trafficker uses *compulsion* to bring about exploitation of others
Human Trafficking: A global crime

Above: Traffic light in Delhi, India - Children who are trafficked for the purpose of begging work late into the night. Children are forced to beg for long hours, commonly beaten by their bosses, and suffer abuse from individuals they encounter as they beg. (US Dept of State)

Above: Eritrean refugee who lost his hands to traffickers in Egypt (US Dept of State)

Above: Women from Colombia are subjected to sex trafficking within Colombia, Asia, the Caribbean, Latin America, and Western Europe. Victims suffer psychological and physical abuse—some at the hands of organized crime and gangs who use threats and debt bondage to force their victims into prostitution.
Global scope of the problem

• Estimated 21 million people globally thought to be trafficked (IOM)
  • For more info, visit US DOL, International Org on Migration, US Dept of State’s websites.

• Most victims globally are labor trafficking victims, including women, children and men

• Polaris Project estimates that nearly 100,000 children in the US are victims of commercial sexual exploitation
Human trafficking in Ohio

• Est. 1,000 children currently being commercially sexually exploited

• Est. 3,000 runaway/throwaway kids at risk of being trafficked
  • In 2013-22,911 missing kids reported by Ohio AG’s office

• 78 kids identified by Ohio Network of Children’s Advocacy Centers since July 2013

• Currently, little understanding of labor trafficking
Human Trafficking- Why Ohio?

- Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA)- passed in 2000

- Awareness in Ohio Increases- FBI’s Operation Precious Cargo
  - December 2005 Harrisburg, PA
  - 151 victims recovered
    - 45 were minors
    - 78/151 victims from Toledo, OH
  - Youngest Victim was 12 years old

- 2 PA State Troopers Convicted
  - Offered to reduce charges in exchange for sex
  - Gave pimps information about prostitution stings
Bigger question- Why anywhere?

• People everywhere exploit people

• We are becoming more aware of the problem, so we find more cases (i.e. Toledo)

• State and federal trafficking laws apply to crimes not previously viewed as trafficking

• Technological advances
  • Historically, people always find ways to exploit technology in undesirable ways
  • Internet/social media uniquely “exploitable”- rapid connection, hidden identities, increasing demand for increasingly disturbing levels of pornography at deeper levels of the web (NCMEC)
Who are traffickers?

- Pimps
- Parents/guardians
- Caregivers
- Businesses
- Domestic employers
- Seasonal farm employers
- Men AND women
- Gangs

There’s not a profile-anyone using force, fraud or coercion to exploit another for profit!
Who are victims in Ohio?

- Women, men, boys and girls
- Foreign born and American born
- People with developmental disabilities
- Missing and runaway kids
- People from urban and rural areas

...there's not a profile!!
Vulnerabilities to Victimization

• Disproportionately affects vulnerable people
  • i.e. runaways, foster care kids, migrant workers-legal and illegal, people with disabilities
  • There are affluent, upper/middle class victims

• AG’s office: In Ohio, 13 is the most common age of entry into the commercial sex market

• Kids with past sexual abuse and kids already involved in illegal activities are especially vulnerable to sexual exploitation
  • Children who experience sexual abuse are 28 times more likely to be arrested for prostitution (US Department of Health and Human Services)

• Victims often do not self identify
  • Their vulnerabilities can make it difficult to reach and inform them about human trafficking.
Cleveland, Ohio -- A mentally disabled woman and her child were held captive for two years by three people in the central Ohio community of Ashland, according to federal labor-trafficking charges announced today.

The woman and her child were forced to live in a basement with pit bulls and pythons, according to the charges released at a news conference by Steven Dettelbach, U.S. attorney for the Northern District of Ohio.

Dettelbach said the woman was beaten, threatened and forced into slavery. Some of the threats included telling the woman she would be attacked by the animals.

"These individuals preyed upon a human being with a disability," Dettelbach said. "They treated her worse than the animals in that house."

Named in the charges are Jordie Callahan, 26, Jessica Hunt, 31, and Daniel J. Brown, 33, all from Ashland.

Court records indicate that a fourth person has been charged. Dettelbach’s office declined comment today on why that person was not named in today’s announcement.

Officials said the woman managed to free herself last October by stealing a candy bar so she would be arrested.

At the news conference, an Ashland police lieutenant said the woman had suffered a
Ohioans selling sex with their own kids

By Alan Johnson
The Columbus Dispatch • Friday July 11, 2014 6:51 AM

Ohio children younger than 6 have been sexually trafficked by their own parents in exchange for drugs, rent and cash, a new report indicates.

Information from the Ohio Network of Children’s Advocacy Centers shows that 51 minors from across the state were potential human-trafficking victims — five of them age 6 or younger — over a nine-month period. The network has a state contract to screen children referred by law enforcement, children’s services agencies and others, to determine whether they may have been trafficked.

Statistics from July 2013 to March 2014 showed all but five of the 51 minors reported were 13 to 18 years old. Only one case involved a male. They came from both urban and rural areas of the state.

“I’m most shocked that families are doing this to their own children,” said the director of the advocacy center that originally detected three of the cases involving the youngest children. She asked not to be identified for this story to avoid pinpointing specific details about the cases that might cause problems for the children, or jeopardize legal proceedings.

“We think it happens to young girls who are runaways. But with these youngest kids, it’s their actual families who are trafficking them.”

She said more information about what happened to very young children gradually comes out over time as they are in counseling and other therapeutic programs.

Information on at least three of the five youngest victims indicated they were trafficked sexually by one or both of their parents in “exchange for drugs, rent, goods or money,” said Amy Deverson Roberts of the children’s advocacy network.

She said some cases have been referred for prosecution and others are under investigation.
HOW TRAFFICKING OCCURS (AND SIGNS & INDICATORS)
How trafficking happens

**The A-M-P Model**

Elements of the Crime of “Severe Forms” of Trafficking in Persons
A Conceptual Model to Understand the Federal Framework of the Crime, as Defined in the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000

Whoever knowingly...

**Action**
Induces, recruits, harbors, transports, provides, or obtains

**Means**
- Force - Causing serious harm or physical restraint
- Fraud
- Coercion – Threats of serious harm to, or physical restraint against, a person or another person
- Coercion – Abuse or threatened abuse of law or legal process
- Coercion – Any scheme, plan, or pattern intended to cause a belief that...

**Purpose**
Commercial sex acts OR Labor or Services

*Sexual Servitude of a Minor: Means (entire 2nd column) not required for minors under age 18 induced into commercial sex acts.

Other related crimes include involuntary servitude, conspiracy to commit trafficking, and benefiting financially from trafficking
CLEVELAND — A federal judge has sentenced a northeast Ohio man to life in prison for prostituting four young women whom he kept addicted to drugs.

A jury convicted Jeremy Mack of Elyria in February on charges that included conspiracy to commit sex trafficking, sex trafficking of a minor and drug trafficking.

A message was left with Mack’s attorney following the sentence handed down today by Akron federal judge Sara Lioi.

An FBI and Elyria police investigation found that the 38-year-old Mack and an Avon Lake woman worked together for months to keep the young women addicted to drugs and would make them work as prostitutes in exchange for drugs.
Types of sex trafficking

- Hostess” Bar/Club Operations with Inflated-Price Schemes
- Eastern European/Russian stripping or exotic dancing “Go-Go Clubs”
- Latino cantina bars
- Asian room salons, hostess clubs, and other karaoke clubs
- Domestic strip clubs and gentleman’s clubs
- Residential/Underground Brothel Settings
- Escort Services (Both Incall and Outcall)
  - Bar/Hotel-based
  - Internet-based
  - Private parties (house, club, lap dance clubs)
  - Boat cruises
  - Phone chat lines
- Pimp-Controlled Prostitution
  - Hotel-based
  - Internet/Escort-based
  - Private parties
  - Street-based
  - Truck stops
  - Other miscellaneous locations

-from Polaris @ www.polarisproject.org
Types of labor trafficking

- Domestic Servitude/Domestic Worker Cases
- Nannies
- Maids/Housekeepers
- Small Businesses/“Mom and Pop” Operations
- Landscaping
- Nail salons
- Restaurants
- Industrial cleaning
- Construction
- Hospitality
- Peddling Rings/Sales Crews
- Magazine sales crews
- Flowers/Candy sales crews
- Large-Scale Labor Cases
- Agricultural
- Factory settings (i.e. garments; food processing)
- Other large factory work environments (i.e. industrial welding)
- Child soldiers

-from Polaris @ www.polarisproject.org
Signs and Indicators of Trafficking

Poor Mental Health or Abnormal Behavior
- Is fearful, anxious, depressed, submissive, tense, or nervous/paranoid
- Exhibits unusually fearful or anxious behavior after bringing up law enforcement
- Avoids eye contact

Poor Physical Health
- Lacks health care
- Appears malnourished
- Shows signs of physical and/or sexual abuse, physical restraint, confinement, or torture

-from Polaris @ www.polarisproject.org
Signs and Indicators of Trafficking, cont’d

Lack of Control
• Has few or no personal possessions
• Is not in control of his/her own money, no financial records, or bank account
• Is not in control of his/her own identification documents (ID or passport)
• Is not allowed or able to speak for themselves (a third party may insist on being present and/or translating)

Other
• Claims of just visiting and inability to clarify where he/she is staying/address
• Lack of knowledge of whereabouts and/or do not know what city he/she is in
• Loss of sense of time
• Has numerous inconsistencies in his/her story

-from Polaris @ www.polarisproject.org
Signs of Trafficking: Children

**Red flags to look for:**

- *Context of whole child important*
- Inconsistencies in stories
- References to working long hours and getting poor pay under abusive bosses
- Look at demeanor, affect and appearance
- Unusual knowledge of work
- Fearful or anxious behavior
- Presence of a controlling, abusive or older boyfriend
- Possession of gifts/cash that can’t be explained
- Chronic runaways
- Recurrent STI’s/STD’s and/or need for pregnancy tests
- Signs of physical assault including: branding or tattooing, broken bones, black eyes, etc
If you suspect human trafficking:

- Call the National Human Trafficking Resource Center 888-3737-888 or 911

- For law enforcement, if you need additional resources, reach out to your local task force or BCI

- Medical providers should follow internal protocols for working with law enforcement (calling NHTRC without patient consent can violate HIPAA)
How do we respond in Ohio?

- State Laws
- Agency initiatives (Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force, Ohio Human Trafficking Commission)
- Grassroots advocacy and service
- Law enforcement task forces
OHIO’S LEGAL FRAMEWORK
Goal of State Laws

1. **Prevent** trafficking (increased public awareness)
2. **Protect** victims (better victim recovery options)
3. **Prosecute** offenders (Traffickers AND Buyers)

Ohio’s anti-trafficking laws (ORC 2905.32) were designed to better reflect federal law and address unique circumstances in our state.
State Law Highlights: Training & Awareness

- Law enforcement are required to have trafficking in persons training and to report all human trafficking cases to BCI (2012)

- School staff required to take human trafficking training (2013)

- OCJS mandated to create anti-trafficking poster (2012) = current state public awareness campaign
State Law Highlights: Victim Protections

• Intervention in Lieu of Conviction for Adults (2014)

• Record expungement (2012)

• Victims can pursue damages (2012)

• Statute of limitations extended from 6 to 20 years (2013)
State Law Highlights: Victim Protections for Minors

- Allows Diversion Program for Minors in juvenile court (2012)
- Provides CCTV testimony option for victims under 16 during a preliminary hearing (2014)
- Allows termination of Parental Rights (2014)
- Prohibits disclosure of Police Reports Involving Minor Victims (2014)
State Law Highlights: Penalties for offenders

- HB 262 (2012) made trafficking-in-persons a felony of the 1st degree with a mandatory minimum 10 years

- Adult sex traffickers must register as sex offenders

- Obstruction of Justice is a 2nd degree felony in human trafficking cases
State Law Highlights: Penalties for Solicitation

• Applies to soliciting another person to engaging in sexual activity for hire (“demand reduction”)

• Tiered penalties based on victim vulnerability:
  • Adult: 3rd degree misdemeanor
  • Person with DD: 3rd degree felony
  • Minor aged 16 or 17 years old: 5th degree felony
  • Minor under age 16: 3rd degree felony
“It’s not ‘child prostitution’ it’s ‘prostituted child’. The adult is the responsible party – the one buying and exploiting.”

-Lisa Thompson, Director of Anti-Trafficking at World Hope International
OTHER STATE POLICY RESPONSES
Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force

- Governor Kasich’s Task Force created by Executive Order in March 2012
- Created to marshal the resources of the state to coordinate HT prevention and response efforts
- 11 state agencies are members and are working to identify service gaps and meet those gaps
- Important: Many of these initiatives work hand in hand with grassroots and coalition initiatives
Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force

• Made and implemented 26 recommendations in 2012:
  ✓ Hired a state Anti-Trafficking Coordinator
  ✓ Created trafficking screening tool used at mental health service providers, victim services and in Ohio’s correctional facilities
  ✓ Increased access to services for victims of trafficking
    ✓ Partnership with 26 Children’s Advocacy Centers
  ✓ Developed and launched a public awareness campaign
  ✓ Mandated and developed training for new caseworkers and offered to foster caregivers
  ✓ Created multi-agency prevention plan
In April 2014, the Reynoldsburg Youth Coalition and Reynoldsburg City Council put up a billboard using at the corner of Haft and Main streets in Central Ohio to raise awareness in their community about the crime of human trafficking.
• Started by the previous AG, Richard Cordray and continued by current AG, Mike DeWine
• Members include Coalition members, non-profit leaders, politicians, law enforcement, and concerned citizens
• Meet quarterly to discuss current initiatives and resources at the state level
Rescue & Restore Coalitions

- Community-level coordination of anti-trafficking efforts
- Some funded
- Opportunity for law enforcement to link with victim service community to identify and obtain assistance in getting services to human trafficking victims
Law Enforcement Task Forces

- LE Task Forces are funded law enforcement entities dedicated to investigating specific crimes, i.e. human trafficking and crimes against children
  - Many work in partnership with coalitions for referrals and service provision for identified victims
  - Important component of Ohio’s response

- Ohio has 3 HT-specific Law Enforcement Task Forces
  - FBI NE Ohio
  - FBI NW Ohio
  - Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force
Resources and Tools

- Ohio’s Toolkit for Serving Victims of Human Trafficking
  - [http://humantrafficking.ohio.gov](http://humantrafficking.ohio.gov)
  - Houses resources developed by the Task Force, state partners, local partners & federal agencies
    - Human Trafficking Screening tool
    - Protocols for serving minors and adults
    - 101 on state and federal laws
    - Speaker requests
    - Map of “who is doing what, where in Ohio” and volunteers
    - Data and reports
    - Up-to-date news, events and trainings
How can you get involved in the fight against trafficking?

• Report suspected trafficking to the National Hotline 888-3737-888 or text BEFREE

• Keep learning
  • Check out resources on http://humantrafficking.ohio.gov and the National Human Trafficking Resource Center

• Support/join your community Rescue and Restore Coalition
  • Local speakers’ bureau
  • Volunteer efforts through coalition—i.e. street outreach
  • Consider financially contributing to reputable anti-trafficking organizations
Reflect:

- What will you do differently in light of what you learned today?
- What partnerships are necessary to build/strengthen in your community to effectively serve victims of human trafficking?
Questions?